

Technical Appendix 5.1: Cultural Heritage Assessment Methodology

Technical Appendix 5.1: Cultural Heritage Assessment Methodology

1.1 Assessment Method

- 1.1.1 The effects of the Proposed Development on heritage assets have been assessed on the basis of their type (direct construction impacts, indirect impacts, setting impacts, and cumulative impacts) and nature (adverse or beneficial). Effects can be permanent, temporary, and/or reversible. The assessment takes into account the value/sensitivity of the heritage asset, its setting, and the magnitude of the predicted impact.
- Direct (physical) construction impacts: occur where the physical fabric of the asset is removed or damaged, or where it is preserved or conserved, as a direct result of the Proposed Development. Such impacts are most likely to occur during the construction phase and are most likely to be permanent.
 - Indirect (physical) impacts: occur where the fabric of an asset, or buried archaeological remains, is removed or damaged, or where it is preserved or conserved, as an indirect result of the Proposed Development even though the asset may lie some distance from it. Such impacts are most likely to occur during the construction phase and are most likely to be permanent.
 - Setting impacts: these are generally direct and result from the Proposed Development causing change within the setting of a heritage asset that affects its cultural significance or the way in which it is understood, appreciated, and experienced. Such impacts are generally, but not exclusively, visual, occurring directly as a result of the appearance of the Proposed Development in the surroundings of the asset. However, they may relate to other senses or factors, such as noise, odour or emissions, or historical relationships that do not relate entirely to intervisibility, such as historic patterns of land-use and related historic features. Such impacts may occur at any stage of a Proposed Development’s lifespan and may be permanent, reversible, or temporary.
 - Cumulative impacts: can relate to the physical fabric or setting of assets. They may arise as a result of impact interactions, either of different impacts of the Proposed Development itself, or additive impacts resulting from incremental changes caused by the Proposed Development together with other projects already in the planning system or allocated in a Local Development Plan.
 - Adverse effects: are those that detract from or reduce cultural significance or special interest of heritage assets or their settings.
 - Beneficial effects: are those that preserve, enhance or better reveal the cultural significance or special interest of heritage assets or their settings.

1.2 Assigning Sensitivity to Heritage Assets

- 1.2.1 Cultural heritage assets are assigned value/importance through the designation process. Designation ensures that sites and places are recognised and protected by law through the planning system and other regulatory processes. The level of protection and how a site or place is managed varies depending on the type of designation and the laws and policies that apply to it (HES 2019)¹.
- 1.2.2 Table 5.1.1 summarises the relative sensitivity of heritage assets (including their settings) relevant to the Proposed Development, based on the guidance set out in the SNH/HES EIA Handbook (version 5; 2018)².

Table 5.1.1: Sensitivity of Heritage Assets	
Sensitivity of Asset	Definition / Criteria
High	Assets valued at an international or national level, including: • Scheduled Monuments • Category A Listed Buildings • Inventory Gardens and Designed Landscapes • Inventory Historic Battlefields • Non-designated assets that meet the relevant criteria for designation (including sites recorded in HERs as non-statutory register (NSR) sites of presumed national importance)
Medium	Assets valued at a regional level, including: • Archaeological sites and areas that have regional value (contributing to the aims of regional research frameworks) • Archaeologically Sensitive Areas (ASA) (where these are identified in Local Authority records) • Non-Inventory Designed Landscapes (NIDL) (where these are identified in Local Authority records) • Category B Listed Buildings • Conservation Areas
Low	Assets valued at a local level, including: • Archaeological sites that have local heritage value • Category C listed buildings • Unlisted historic buildings and townscapes with local (vernacular) characteristics
Negligible	Assets of little or no intrinsic heritage value, including: • Artefact find-spots (where the artefacts are no longer in situ and where their provenance is uncertain) • Poorly preserved examples of particular types of features (e.g. quarries and gravel pits, dilapidated sheepfolds, etc)

1.3 Criteria for Assessing the Significance of Effects

- 1.3.1 The magnitude of impact (adverse or beneficial) has been assessed in the categories, high, medium, low, and negligible and described in Table 5.1.2.

Table 5.1.2: Magnitude of Impact		
Magnitude of Impact	Criteria	
	Adverse	Beneficial
High	Changes to the fabric or setting of a heritage asset resulting in the complete or near complete loss of the asset’s cultural significance, such that it may no longer be considered a heritage asset.	Preservation of a heritage asset in situ where it would otherwise be completely or almost completely lost in the do-nothing scenario.

¹ HES (2019) Designation Policy and Selection Guidance, Edinburgh. Available at: <https://www.historicenvironment.scot/archives-and-research/publications/publication/?publicationId=8d8bbaeb-ce5a-46c1-a558-aa2500ff7d3b>

² SNH & Historic Environment Scotland (2018) ‘Environmental Impact Assessment Handbook’ (<https://web.archive.org/web/20220901050635/https://www.nature.scot/sites/default/files/2018-05/Publication%202018%20-%20Environmental%20Impact%20Assessment%20Handbook%20V5.pdf>)

Table 5.1.2: Magnitude of Impact		
Magnitude of Impact	Criteria	
	Adverse	Beneficial
Medium	Changes to those elements of the fabric or setting of a heritage asset that contribute to its cultural significance such that this quality is substantially altered.	Changes to key elements of a heritage asset’s fabric or setting, resulting in its cultural significance being preserved (where this would otherwise be lost) or restored.
Low	Changes to those elements of the fabric or setting of a heritage asset that contribute to its cultural significance such that this quality is slightly altered.	Changes that result in elements of a heritage asset’s fabric or setting detracting from its cultural significance being removed.
Negligible	Changes to fabric or setting of a heritage asset that leave its cultural significance unchanged and do not affect how it is experienced, appreciated, and understood.	

1.4 Assessment of Effects on Setting

- 1.4.1 The SNH/HES EIA Handbook (2018)² Appendix 1, paragraph 42 advises that:

"In the context of cultural heritage impact assessment, the receptors are the heritage assets and impacts will be considered in terms of the change in their cultural significance".

Historic Environment Scotland’s guidance document, 'Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Setting' (HES 2016)³, notes that:

"Setting can be important to the way in which historic structures or places are understood, appreciated and experienced. It can often be integral to a historic asset’s cultural significance."

"Setting often extends beyond the property boundary or ‘curtilage’ of an individual historic asset into a broader landscape context".

The guidance also advises that:

"If a proposed development is likely to affect the setting of a key historic asset, an objective written assessment should be prepared by the applicant to inform the decision-making process. The conclusions should take into account the significance of the asset and its setting and attempt to quantify the extent of any impact. The methodology and level of information should be tailored to the circumstances of each case".
- 1.4.2 The guidance recommends that there are three stages in assessing the impact of a development on the setting of a historic asset or place:
 - Stage 1: identify the historic assets that might be affected by the Proposed Development;
 - Stage 2: define and analyse the setting by establishing how the surroundings contribute to the ways in which the historic asset or place is understood, appreciated and experienced; and,
 - Stage 3: evaluate the potential impact of the proposed changes on the setting, and the extent to which any negative impacts can be mitigated.
- 1.4.3 The SNH/HES EIA Handbook (2018) ² Appendix 1, paragraph 43 advises that:

"When considering setting impacts, visual change should not be equated directly with adverse impact. Rather the impact should be assessed with reference to the degree that the proposal affects those aspects of setting that contribute to the asset’s cultural significance".
- 1.4.4 Following these recommendations, the turbine blade tip and hub height ZTVs for the Proposed Development have been used to identify those heritage assets from which there would be theoretical visibility of one or more of the proposed wind turbines, and the degree of theoretical visibility.

- 1.4.5 Scheduled Monuments, non-designated assets identified in the HER as 'potentially of schedulable quality' (NSR sites) where long-distance views and intervisibility are an important aspect of their settings, Category A and B Listed Buildings, and Conservation Areas, where present within 10 km of the outermost turbines, are included in the assessment.
- 1.4.6 Category C Listed buildings within 5 km of the outermost turbines are included in the assessment.
- 1.4.7 Consideration has also been given to designated heritage assets beyond 10 km where long-distance views and intervisibility between monuments are an important aspect of their settings.
- 1.4.8 Consideration has been given to designated heritage assets where there is no predicted visibility from the asset but where views of or across the asset are important factors contributing to its cultural significance. In such cases, consideration is given to whether the Proposed Development could appear in the background to those views.
- 1.4.9 The sensitivity of the asset (Table 5.1.1) and the magnitude of the predicted impact (Table 5.1.2) are used to inform an assessment of the significance of the effect (direct or indirect effects, or effect on setting), summarised using the formula set out in the matrix in Table 5.1.3. The matrix employs a graduated scale of significance (from Negligible to Major effects) and where two outcomes are possible through application of the matrix, professional judgment supported by reasoned justification, has been used to determine the level of significance.

Table 5.1.3: Significance of Effects				
Magnitude of Impact	Sensitivity of Asset			
	High	Medium	Low	Negligible
High	Major	Major / Moderate	Moderate / Minor	Minor / Negligible
Medium	Major / Moderate	Moderate	Moderate / Minor	Minor / Negligible
Low	Moderate / Minor	Moderate / Minor	Minor	Negligible
Negligible	Minor / Negligible	Minor / Negligible	Negligible	Negligible

- 1.4.10 Major and Moderate effects are considered to be ‘significant’ in the context of the *Electricity Works (Environmental Impact Assessment) (Scotland) Regulations 2017* (EIA Regulations)⁴. Minor and Negligible effects are considered to be ‘not significant’.
- 1.4.11 Where a significant effect on the setting of an asset is predicted as a result of change within its surroundings, using the approach outlined above, an assessment is made as to whether that effect would result in a significant adverse effect on the integrity of its setting (NPF 4 Policy 7)⁵. For the purposes of the assessment, the integrity of the setting is considered to be adequately maintained if the setting’s contribution to the cultural significance of the monument would not be compromised by the Proposed Development either alone or cumulatively.

1.5 Cumulative Assessment

- 1.5.1 The assessment of cumulative effects on heritage assets is based upon consideration of the effects of the Proposed Development on the settings of assets with statutory designations and non-statutory designations within the Outer Study Area, in addition to the likely effects of other developments that are consented or are currently at the application stage (and for which sufficient detail is available upon which to develop an assessment). Operational and under construction developments are considered

³ Historic Environment Scotland (2016, updated 2020) 'Managing Change in the Historic Environment – Setting', Edinburgh (<https://www.historicenvironment.scot/archives-and-research/publications/publication/?publicationId=80b7c0a0-584b-4625-b1fd-a60b009c2549>)

⁴ Scottish Government (2017) Electricity Works (Environmental Impact Assessment) (Scotland) Regulations 2017, Edinburgh, available at: http://www.legislation.gov.uk/ssi/2017/101/pdfs/ssi_20170101_en.pdf

⁵ Scottish Government (2023) National Planning Framework for Scotland 4, Edinburgh, available at: <https://www.gov.scot/publications/national-planning-framework-4/>

part of the assessment baseline. Proposed developments at the scoping or pre-application stage are not included in the assessment, as such proposals are not fully formed and may be subject to changes that cannot be foreseen. The schemes included in the cumulative impact assessment are those identified through the LVIA consultations with South Lanarkshire Council and NatureScot.

- 1.5.2 The assessment of cumulative effects on the settings of heritage assets from the Proposed Development in combination with pre-existing developments is addressed in the course of the assessment of effects of the Proposed Development alone, as pre-existing developments are part of the baseline environment.
- 1.5.3 The cumulative assessment takes into account the relative scale (i.e. size and number of turbines) of the identified developments, their distance from the affected assets, and the potential degree of visibility of the various developments from the assets under consideration. The use of cumulative wireline visualisations has been used to aid the assessment.

1.6 Policy and legislation

- 1.6.1 The assessment has been prepared following the following documents:

Legislation

- Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act 1979 (as amended by Town and Country Planning (Historic Environment Scotland) Amendment Regulations 2015)⁶.
- Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas (Scotland) Act 1997⁷ (as amended by Historic Environment (Amendment) (Scotland) Act 2015) ⁸.
- Electricity Works (Environmental Impact Assessment) (Scotland) Regulations 2017 (EIA Regulations)
- Town and Country Planning (Development Management Procedure) (Scotland) Regulations 2013⁹
- Town and Country Planning (Environmental Impact Assessment) Regulations 2017¹⁰.

Planning Policies

- National Planning Framework (NPF 4) (Policy 7)¹¹.
- Historic Environment Policy for Scotland (HEPS) (HES 2019)¹².
- South Lanarkshire Local Development Plan 2 (2021)¹³, including Supplementary Guidance.

⁶ HM Government (1979) Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act 1979 (reprinted 1996), HMSO, London, available at: http://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/1979/46/pdfs/ukpga_19790046_en.pdf

⁷ HM Government (1997) Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997, HMSO, London, available at: http://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/1997/9/pdfs/ukpga_19970009_en.pdf

⁸ Historic Environment (Amendment) (Scotland) Act 2011). Available at: <https://www.legislation.gov.uk/asp/2011/3/data.pdf>

⁹ HM Government (2013) The Town and Country Planning (Development Management Procedure) (Scotland) Regulations 2013 Available at: <https://www.legislation.gov.uk/ssi/2013/>

¹⁰ Scottish Government (2017) The Town and Country Planning (Environmental Impact Assessment) (Scotland) Regulations 2017, Edinburgh, available at: http://www.legislation.gov.uk/ssi/2017/102/pdfs/ssi_20170102_en.pdf

¹¹ Scottish Government (2023) National Planning Framework for Scotland 4, Edinburgh, available at: <https://www.gov.scot/publications/national-planning-framework-4/>

¹² HES (2019) Historic Environment Policy for Scotland (HEPS). Available at: <https://www.historicenvironment.scot/advice-and-support/planning-and-guidance/historic-environment-policy-for-scotland-heps/>

¹³ South Lanarkshire Local Development Plan 2 (2021). Available at: https://www.southlanarkshire.gov.uk/info/200145/planning_and_building_standards/39/development_plans/2